Advances in developing screening methods and improving aluminum resistance in common bean and 
*Brachiaria*

**ABSTRACT**

We summarize progress made towards the development of tools and knowledge that aid the genetic improvement of aluminum (Al) resistance in two of CIAT’s (International Center for Tropical Agriculture) commodity crops; common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) and brachiariagrasses (*Brachiaria* spp. Grisil). Approximately 40% of common bean production is on acid soils where Al toxicity limits root development. Improving Al resistance, therefore, is an important breeding objective. We compared a group of 53 Al-resistant bean genotypes with differing levels of adaptation to acid soils to identify Al resistant genotypes using a hydroponic screening method. Four different root traits (percent inhibition of root elongation, percent increase of average root diameter, total root length per plant and total number of root tips per plant) were identified as useful indicators for Al resistance. Application of this method to 30 accessions of scarlet runner bean (*P. coccineus* L.) identified three Al-resistant genotypes that could be used for introgressing Al resistance into cultivated germplasm. Work is in progress to characterize the physiological mechanisms underpinning Al resistance in common bean. This will facilitate developing simplified screening procedures and identifying quantitative trait loci (QTLs) contributing to Al resistance. Compared to common bean, brachiariagrasses tend to be better adapted to acid soils.Yet edaphic adaptation is an important component of CIAT’s and EMBRAPA’s (Empresa Brasileira de Pesquisa Agropecuária) breeding programs because one of the three parental genotypes is poorly adapted. We developed and incorporated into our breeding program a solution-culture technique that uses rooted stem cuttings to screen for Al resistance and root vigor, both of which are segregating in breeding populations. Physiological research into the remarkably high level of Al resistance of signalgrass (*B. decumbens* Stapf) has ruled out a significant contribution of organic-acid secretion or by staining root apices with hematoxylin (Kerridge et al., 1968; Polle et al., 1978; Ruiz-Torres et al., 1992; Kochian et al., 2005; Ma and Furukawa, 2003; Ma et al., 2001; Matsumoto, 2000; Matsumoto, 2005; Vitorello et al., 2005).

**INTRODUCTION**

The highly weathered acid soils of the tropics are characterized by a combination of nutrient deficiencies and mineral toxicities (Rao et al., 1993; Rao and Cramer, 2003). It is estimated that over 50% of the world’s potentially arable lands are acidic with pH < 5.5 (von Uexkull and Mutert, 1995; Bot et al., 2000). Up to 60% of the acid soils in the world are in developing countries, where food production is particularly critical. Al phytotoxicity is the primary limitation to agricultural production on these acid soils. At soil pH values of 5 or below, toxic forms of Al are solubilized into the soil solution. These inhibit root growth and function and thus reduce crop and forage yields.

The primary and earliest symptom of Al toxicity is a rapid (within minutes) inhibition of root elongation (Ryan et al., 1993; Sivaguru and Horst, 1998). The distal part of the transition zone in the root apex was identified as the primary site of action of toxic Al ions (Sivaguru and Horst, 1998). Research conducted over the past two decades on the physiology, genetics and molecular biology of plant Al resistance and toxicity has shown that Al resistance can be achieved by mechanisms that exclude Al from the root apex (Al exclusion) and/or by mechanisms that enable plants to tolerate Al in the symplasm (Al tolerance) (Barcelo and Poschenreider, 2002; Garvin and Carver, 2003; Kochian et al., 2004; Kochian et al., 2005; Ma and Furukawa, 2003; Ma et al., 2001; Matsumoto, 2000; Matsumoto, 2005; Vitorello et al., 2005).

Existing information clearly indicates that long-term, sustainable crop and forage production on acid soils requires both Al-resistant cultivars and appropriate agronomic practices. Significant progress has been made in increasing Al resistance to improve crop production on acid soils (Garvin and Carver, 2003; Hede et al., 2001). Most genetic and physiological studies have focused on major cereal crops such as wheat, rice and maize (Kochian et al., 2005). In wheat, Al resistance is genetically simple, with a single major gene accounting for most of the resistance. In rice and maize, however, Al resistance is quantitatively inherited and involves a number of different genes and possibly a variety of physiological mechanisms.

Aluminum resistance is usually assessed in seedling-based assays, either by quantifying root elongation or apical callose concentrations, or by staining root apices with hematoxylin (Kerridge and Kronstad, 1968; Polle et al., 1978; Ruiz-Torres et al., 1992;
Llugany et al., 1994; Cançado et al., 1999). Before incorporating any of these assays into a breeding program, it is important to validate their efficacy in identifying adapted genotypes and to establish the relative importance of Al resistance compared to other acid-soil constraints (e.g., phosphorus or nitrogen deficiencies). In cases where Al resistance is genetically complex and based on physiological traits encoded by different loci, breeding programs are likely to benefit from a better understanding of physiological mechanisms because only then can physiologically-based selection strategies be designed to enrich for the desired alleles at individual loci. Such a dissection of Al resistance into physiological components could also facilitate the identification of quantitative trait loci (QTL) and candidate genes associated with Al-resistance, and could help to predict the long-term impacts of Al-resistant cultivars. Our review summarizes the progress made toward achieving some of these goals for two of CIAT’s commodity crops: common bean and brachiariagrasses.

**COMMON BEAN**

Common bean is the world’s most important food legume, with an annual production value in excess of US$10 billion. It is produced mainly on small-scale farms in developing countries in Latin America and Africa (80% of dry bean production). About 40% of the bean-growing area is affected by Al toxicity, resulting in decrease of grain yield between 30% and 60% (Thung and Rao, 1999; Rao, 2001a). The crop needs significant improvement in Al resistance to reduce the dependence of small farmers on lime and fertilizer inputs.

**Genetic variation in acid-soil adaptation**

Genetic variation exists for acid soil adaptation among common bean genotypes (Rao et al., 2004). Field screening of 5,000 germplasm accessions and bred lines in Al-toxic soils with and without lime (70% Al saturation) and participatory evaluation with farmers have resulted in identification of several promising genotypes. Field screening for Al resistance would seem to be the most desirable approach, because it best approximates the intended cropping environment. In practice, however, reliable ranking of genotypes in the field may be difficult. This is mainly because exchangeable Al levels may not be uniform and also environmental factors could interact with soil Al to mask the expression of Al resistance. Thus it is necessary to combine field screening with greenhouse screening techniques based on physiological traits of Al resistance.

The most frequently measured effect of excess Al is inhibition of root elongation. Nutrient solution studies are better suited for determining more precisely the AI activity that is influencing root elongation, exclusive to other associated acid-soil-stress constraints. In order to identify genotypes resistant to Al, additional ions in solution that may be toxic, such as H+, and ions that may help alleviate Al toxicity, such as Ca2+, must be controlled (Rangel et al., 2005). Nutrient solution culture allows evaluation of a large number of genotypes quickly and could be very useful for identification of (i) parental genotypes with contrasting root architecture for bean breeding, (ii) contrasting genotypes for physiological analysis, (iii) QTLs related to Al resistance, and (iv) candidate genes associated with Al resistance in common bean.

**A solution-culture technique for evaluating Al resistance**

We developed a greenhouse screening method that uses low-ionic-strength nutrient solutions to evaluate genotypic differences in Al resistance based on root traits of seedlings (CIAT, 2003, 2004, 2005; Manrique et al., 2006). Seeds were germinated on filter paper for 2 to 3 days, and seedlings with uniform root lengths (5-7 cm) were selected for evaluation in nutrient solutions composed of (in mM): 286 CaSO4, 300 KNO3, 150 NH4NO3, 2.5 NaH2PO4, 150 MgCl2, 14 CaCl2, 5 FeCl3, 5 NaEDTA, 1 MnCl2, 1 ZnCl2, 0.2 CuCl2, 6 H3BO3, 5 Na2SiO3, 0.001 NaMoO4, 57.5 NaCl and with or without 50 μM AlCl3 (pH 4.5). Changes in root elongation caused by Al were monitored by measuring root elongation during the first three days of the Al treatment. After harvest, the root systems were stained and scanned to determine total root length, average root diameter, number of root tips and total root volume (CIAT, 2003).

The hydroponic screening method was used to evaluate a group of 52 common bean genotypes (landraces and breeding lines) and 66 recombinant inbred lines (RIL) derived from the cross G 5273 × MAM 36. We identified three Andean genotypes (G 19633, BRB 191 and G 5273), eight Mesoamerican genotypes (G 1261, MAR 1, DOR 714, FEB 190, G 11015, G 3513, A 774 and G 855) based on the relationship between the % inhibition of total root length and the % of increase of average root diameter per plant (Fig. 1). Genotypes that showed lower values of % inhibition of total root length and % increase of average root diameter were identified as Al resistant. We also identified four RIL which had a higher level of Al resistance than the other RIL (CIAT, 2003, 2004). This study also indicated that percent inhibition of root elongation, percent increase of average root diameter, total root length per plant and total number of root tips per plant could serve as screening parameters to identify Al-resistant common bean genotypes (Manrique et al., 2006).

During a screening of 30 germplasm accessions of scarlet runner bean we identified three accessions (G 35341, G 35266, G 35025) with a high level of Al resistance (CIAT, 2005). These accessions could serve as donor parents for introgressing Al resistance into common bean (CIAT, 2005).

**Physiological mechanisms of Al resistance**

Physiological studies conducted at the University of Hannover, Germany, showed that common bean is very sensitive of low pH (4.3) with large genotypic differences in proton sensitivity (Rangel et al., 2005). Therefore, proton toxicity prevented screening of common bean genotypes for Al resistance using the protocol established for maize (0.5 mM CaCl2, 8 μM H3BO3, pH 4.3). Increasing the pH to 4.5, the Ca2+ concentration to 5 mM, and adding 0.5 mM KCl fully prevented proton toxicity in all cultivars and allowed us to identify differences in Al resistance among 28 cultivars by quantifying the inhibition of root elongation at 20 μM Al during 36 h as parameter of Al injury. As in maize, Al treatment induced callose formation in root apices of common bean. Al-induced callose formation reflected well the alleviating effect of Ca2+ ions on Al intoxication as revealed by root-growth inhibition. Comparing 28 bean genotypes differing in Al resistance after 36 h of Al treatment, Al-induced callose formation in root apices was positively correlated with Al-induced inhibition of root elongation and the Al content of root apices. The relationship, however, was less than previously reported for maize. Also, after 12 h of Al treatment, neither callose formation nor the Al content of root apices reflected the difference in Al resistance between two contrasting cultivars, which indicated a different mode of expression of Al toxicity and resistance in common bean (Rangel et al., 2005).

Recent studies showed that common bean has a pattern II of organic-acid exudation (A. Rangel and W. Horst, unpublished results). A lag period of 4 to 6 h was observed between addition of Al
and release of organic anions from root tips. The main anions exuded were succinate, malate, citrate, oxalate, and pyruvate. Aluminum resistance was associated with higher organic-anion contents in root tips. Work is in progress to further characterize physiological mechanisms of Al resistance. We are following a scheme that combines physiological analyses, QTL mapping for specific traits, and quantification of edaphic adaptation in the field, to link component traits with overall Al resistance and to determine the relative importance of individual traits.

**BRACHIARIAGRASSES**

Perennial brachiariagrasses (Brachiaria spp. Griseb.) are the most widely sown forage grasses in tropical America (Miles et al., 2004; CIAT and EMBRAPA are developing interspecific hybrids to combine traits of three parental species: acid-soil adaptation of signalgrass (*B. decumbens*) and spittlebug resistance of palsaadegrass (*B. brizantha* (A. Rich) Staff)), both tetraploid apomicts, and sexual reproduction of a tetraploidized, sexual biotype of ruzigrass (*B. ruziizensis* German & Evard), which lacks both agronomic traits (Miles et al., 2004; Miles et al., 2006). Efficient screening methodologies are required to recover the desired traits through stepwise accumulation of favorable alleles in subsequent cycles of selection and recombination. Edaphic adaptation is particularly difficult to select for because it is only manifest in the persistence of pastures over several growing seasons.

**Aluminum toxicity and other acid-soil constraints**

In the past, edaphic adaptation of brachiariagrasses was exclusively evaluated by quantifying forage yield and pasture persistence in field trials (Rao et al., 1996; Miles et al., 2004). These trials have resulted in the release of several well-adapted cultivars such as cv. Basilisk (signalgrass), Tully, and Llanero (Miles et al., 2004). Leaf area, biomass and N content as well as the partitioning of N and P to leaves were found to be useful predictors of adaptation and persistence on infertile, acid soils (Miles et al., 2004). Adapted genotypes typically had root and shoot attributes that facilitated acquisition and/or efficient use of key nutrients (N, P, and Ca) in a low-pH, high-Al soil. These attributes include: (i) maintenance of root growth at the expense of shoot growth; (ii) an extensive root system; (iii) a highly branched root system with many apices facilitating Ca uptake (e.g., *B. ruziizensis*); (iv) the ability to acquire and utilize both NO₃⁻ and NH₄⁺ (e.g., *B. humidicola*); and (v) the ability to acquire N through associative fixation (e.g., signalgrass) (Rao et al., 1996; Li et al., 1997; Rao et al., 1998, 1999a, b; Rao, 2001a, b; Wenzl et al., 2001, 2002a, b, 2003; Ishitani et al., 2004; Miles et al., 2004; Nanamori et al., 2004; Wagatsuma et al., 2005a, b; Wenzl et al., 2006; Begum et al., 2006; Watanabe et al., 2006; Haussler et al., 2006). It was not clear whether there was genetic variation among brachiariagrass genotypes for Al resistance per se.

In an attempt to disentangle the various stress factors affecting growth of brachiariagrasses on acid soils, we designed a nutrient solution that simulated the ionic composition of soil solutions extracted from two Oxisols collected in the Colombian savannas (Wenzl et al., 2003). Relative growth of seedlings in this solution (compared to unstrained conditions) ranked the three parental genotypes of the Brachiaria breeding program the same way they had been ranked in field trials based on pasture persistence over several growing seasons. A comparison among several growth conditions suggested that Al sensitivity of less-adapted ruzigrass increased disproportionately under low nutrient supply. This conclusion was further verified by measuring root elongation of seedlings in solutions containing only CaCl₂, AlCl₃, H⁺ and Cl⁻ ions (Wenzl et al., 2001). These assays showed that well-adapted signalgrass could tolerate an approximately fivefold higher level of Al than poorly-adapted ruzigrass, even though the resistance level of ruzigrass was comparable to wheat, triticale and maize genotypes previously classified as Al-resistant.

**A solution-culture technique for simultaneously evaluating Al resistance and root vigor**

The selection scheme of the Brachiaria breeding program at CIAT is based on the simultaneously assessment of a set of genotypes for various traits including edaphic adaptation, insect and disease resistance, nutritional quality and seed production (Miles et al., 2004). All phenotypic assays, therefore, need to be based on vegetative propagules (rooted stem cuttings) rather than seedlings. We thus converted the seedling-based Al-resistance assay (Wenzl et al., 2001) into a format that was suitable for the adventitious roots of stem cuttings, by increasing the concentration of Al (200 µM AlCl₃, 200 µM CaCl₂, pH 4.2) and simultaneously quantifying the intrinsic root vigor of each genotype in a solution containing only 200 µM CaCl₂ (pH 4.2) (Wenzl et al., 2006). The large differences in root vigor among the parental genotypes made it necessary to adjust total root length in the Al-containing solution for total root length in the absence of Al (or any other nutrients except Ca). Importantly, adjusted root-length values (RL_ad) ranked parental genotypes the same way they had been ranked in field trials and the seedling-based Al-resistance assay. RL_ad values differed quantitatively in a set of ruzigrass × signalgrass hybrids, consistent with multiple genes contributing to Al resistance of adventitious roots.

The concurrent assessment of root length in the Al-free solution revealed a large amount of genetic variation for root vigor in the absence of nutrients; the root system of the best (transgressive) segregants was more than eight times longer than that of poorly-adapted ruzigrass (Wenzl et al., 2006). Vigorous root growth should improve a plant's nutrient-foraging ability (particularly for immobile nutrients such as P) and was previously identified as associated with pasture persistence (Rao et al., 1996). Root vigor, therefore, emerged as another selection target in the context of edaphic adaptation and was easily incorporated into the breeding program through our solution culture technique.

Implementation of a simplified version of this screening method, which allows simultaneous assessment of Al resistance and root vigor based on visual inspection, has facilitated breeding progress toward edaphic adaptation during the last five years. We have identified several well-adapted Brachiaria hybrids that had been pre-selected for insect (spittlebug) resistance (Rao et al., 2006). In 2002, we identified two sexual hybrids (SX01NO/3178) and SX01NO/7249 and one apomictical hybrid (BR02NO/1621) with superior Al resistance/root vigor than that of the parental ruzigrass (BRUZ/44-02). In 2003, we identified two hybrids (BR02NO/1372 and BR02NO/1621) with better edaphic adaptation than that of most hybrids generated in the Brachiaria breeding program until then. In 2004, we evaluated a sexual population of 745 hybrids along with 14 reference genotypes. The improvement of Al resistance and root vigor of the sexual hybrids (SX03NO/0846, SX03NO/2367, SX03NO/0881) was very marked when compared with the sexual population of 2001. In 2005, we screened 139 apomictic/sexual hybrids and identified nine (BR04NO/1018, BR04NO/1552, BR04NO/1900, BR04NO/2110, BR04NO/2128, BR04NO/2166, BR04NO/2179, BR04NO/2201 and BR04NO/2681) that were superior to the well-adapted signalgrass parent, CIAT 606 (Fig. 2). Results

from this BR04NO population on Al resistance clearly indicated that the level of Al resistance is improving for each breeding cycle illustrating the genetic gain from a very efficient recurrent selection program (Miles et al., 2004; Rao et al., 2006).

Physiological mechanisms of Al resistance

Aluminum exclusion

The outstandingly high level of Al resistance identified in signalgrass has triggered a series of experiments to investigate its physiological foundations. The close relationship between Al accumulation in root apices and inhibition of root growth could suggest that exclusion mechanisms might contribute to Al resistance (Wenzl et al., 2001; Wagatsuma et al., 2005a). However, secretion of organic acids and phosphate at root apices, a widespread mechanism of Al exclusion in plants (Kochian et al., 2004), was clearly not the main Al exclusion/resistance mechanism in signalgrass. First, apices of signalgrass secreted quantities of organic acids only moderately larger than those of ruzigrass. Second, organic acid and phosphate efflux rates at signalgrass apices were 3.4 to 30-fold lower than those of Al-resistant genotypes of buckwheat, maize and wheat, which are several-fold more sensitive to Al than signalgrass. These results suggest that hitherto uncharacterized mechanism(s) are responsible for exclusion of Al from root apices of signalgrass.

A separate line of evidence suggests that Al-resistance of signalgrass may only be a facet of a more generic resistance mechanism to inorganic cations. We found that the difference in Al resistance between signalgrass and ruzigrass coincided with a similar difference in resistance to a range of trivalent lanthanide cations and some divalent cations (Wenzl et al., 2004). It seems plausible to assume that resistance to a range of different toxicants can be more easily achieved through an exclusion mechanism than through an internal, detoxification mechanism; different toxicants are likely to have different intracellular targets and may thus require different internal modes of action.

It may be no coincidence that recent experiments at Yamagata University are pointing towards a possible role of root plasma membrane (PM) negativity and/or PM composition in Al resistance of signalgrass (Wagatsuma et al., 2005a, b). When examining signalgrass, ruzigrass and 16 different cultivars of buckwheat, maize and wheat, which are several-fold more sensitive to Al than signalgrass. The hybrid to use P more efficiently (Nanamori et al., 2004). Interactions between Al toxicity and P deficiency

Aluminum toxicity and P deficiency tend to occur in parallel in infertile acid soils, largely because Al forms insoluble precipitates with phosphate (Rao et al., 1993; Rao and Cramer, 2003). Chemical interactions between Al and P within plant tissues are commonly considered an important secondary effect of Al toxicity. In brachiariagrasses, Al had no effect on P concentrations in root apices of Al-resistant signalgrass but led to a severe decline in apices of ruzigrass, thus suggesting an Al-induced inhibition of acropetal P transport in roots (Wenzl et al., 2002b).

Immobilization of P by Al within plant tissues could be prevented through compartmentalization of Al in vacuoles (roots, shoots) or inhibition of root-to-shoot translocation of Al (shoots; see previous section). Alternatively, a range of metabolic adjustments and accelerated P recycling could increase the efficiency with which P is taken up and/or used in Al-stressed plants. A recent study showed that, when grown on a low-P soil, the Bracharia hybrid cv. Mulato had a higher P use efficiency (PUE: biomass produced per amount of P taken up) than wheat or rice (Begum et al., 2006). In contrast to wheat and rice, PUE of the Bracharia hybrid increased under more severe P deficiency and soil acidity. The Bracharia hybrid synthesized larger amounts of organic acids such as oxalate and fumarate in leaves. Phosphorus deficiency further increased organic acid accumulation, presumably as a consequence of a twofold increase in leaf phosphoenolpyruvate carboxylase (PEPC) activity and a decreased the malate inhibition ratio of the enzyme. This PEPC stimulation was even more pronounced in Bracharia roots, where it could play a role in the synthesis of organic acids exuded by roots to aid P acquisition from poorly soluble sources such as Al phosphate. Phosphorus deficiency also induced phosphohydrolases in the Bracharia hybrid and enhanced the partitioning of photosynthate into amino acids and organic acids at the expense of carbohydrates. These metabolic adjustments appeared to generate a larger pool of inorganic P than in other species such as rice, which apparently stimulated P turnover and enabled the hybrid to use P more efficiently (Nanamori et al., 2004).
THE WAY FORWARD

We use a multidisciplinary approach to cross-validate and integrate information from breeding, agronomy, physiology, soil science, plant nutrition and molecular genetics. Physiological and molecular studies of Brachiaria hybrids and RIL of beans provide a path towards the identification of physiological mechanisms and genomic regions contributing to Al resistance, which in turn could lead to the isolation of genes contributing to Al resistance. The socioeconomic impact of improved crop and forage germplasm would be immense in terms of increased food production, more efficient use of purchased inputs, and improved integration of crop-livestock systems.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Jaumer Ricaurte, Ramiro Garcia, Maria Eugenia Recio, Jarden Molina and Martin Otero for their research support. This work was partially funded by the Colombian Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, the German Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ/GTZ Projects 2000.7860.0.001.00; 05.7860.9-001.00) and the Commission for Developmental Issues of the Austrian Academy of Sciences (Project No. 78).

REFERENCES


RUIZ-TORRES, N.A.; CARVER, B.F.; WESTERMAN, R. L.
RAO, I.; CRAMER, G. Plant nutrition and crop improvement in adverse
RYAN, P.; DITOMASSO, J.; KOCHIAN, L. Aluminum toxicity in roots:
RAO, I.M.; ZEIGLER, R.S.; VERA, R.; SARKARUNG, S. Selection
SIVAGURU, M.; HORST, W. The distal part of the transition zone is
THUNG, M.; RAO, I.M. Integrated management of abiotic stresses.
RAO, I.M.; FRIESEN, D.K.; OSAKI, M. Plant adaptation to
RAO, I.M.; FRIESEN, D.K.; HORST, W.J. Opportunities for
RAO, I.M.; BEEBE, S.; RICAURTE, J.; TERAN, H.; SINGH, S.


XIX International Grassland Congress


Figure legends

R. Bras. Agrociência, Petrola, v.14, n.4-p.01-07, out-dez, 2008
Fig. 1. Relationship between the % inhibition of total root length and the % of increase of average root diameter per plant of 52 common bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.) genotypes as affected by Al (50 µM) in nutrient solution. The values of % inhibition were obtained from [(total root length without Al – total root length with Al) / (total root length without Al)] x 100. The values of % increase in average root diameter were obtained from [(average root diameter with Al – average root diameter without Al) / (average root diameter without Al)] x 100.

Fig. 2. Relationship between total root length with Al and total root length without Al in solution of 149 genotypes including 139 *Brachiaria* spp. Grisib apomictic/sexual hybrids of the BR04NO population, 3 parents (CIAT 606, BRUZ/44-02, CIAT 6294) and 7 checks. Genotypes that developed greater root length under both conditions were considered as Al resistant and were identified in the upper box of the right hand side.